

## Second report on manuscript by Esteve-Paredes and Placios

Overall I judge that the authors have done a conscientious job in replying to my comments and making corresponding changes in the manuscript.

I still have reservations about the way my comments 1(b) and 1(d) were answered. (Incidentally, the authors misquoted 1(b) with a cut-and-paste typo; the sentence should have read “First, isn’t it true that  $\langle n\mathbf{k}|\mathbf{v}|n'\mathbf{k}\rangle_v$  in Eq. (1) contains a  $\delta_{\mathbf{k}\mathbf{k}'}$ ?”.) If we accept from other arguments that  $\langle n\mathbf{k}|\mathbf{v}|n'\mathbf{k}'\rangle_v$  is diagonal in  $\mathbf{k}$  (e.g., using that  $\mathbf{v}$  is a periodic operator), and in view of the  $\omega_{n\mathbf{k},n'\mathbf{k}}$  prefactor, we only have to evaluate  $\langle n\mathbf{k}|\mathbf{r}|n'\mathbf{k}\rangle_v$  for  $\mathbf{k} = \mathbf{k}'$  and  $n \neq n'$ . Here I adopt the notation that  $\tilde{\psi}$  are the wave functions normalized to volume  $L = Na$  while  $\psi = \sqrt{N}\tilde{\psi}$  are normalized to a primitive cell. Then in 1D

$$\begin{aligned}\langle n\mathbf{k}|\mathbf{r}|n'\mathbf{k}\rangle_v &= \int_0^{Na} dx x \tilde{\psi}_{n\mathbf{k}}^*(x) \tilde{\psi}_{n'\mathbf{k}}(x) \\ &= \frac{1}{N} \int_0^{Na} dx x \psi_{n\mathbf{k}}^*(x) \psi_{n'\mathbf{k}}(x) \\ &= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{j=0}^{N-1} \int_{ja}^{(j+1)a} dx x \psi_{n\mathbf{k}}^*(x) \psi_{n'\mathbf{k}}(x) \\ &= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{j=0}^{N-1} \int_0^a dx (x + ja) \psi_{n\mathbf{k}}^*(x) \psi_{n'\mathbf{k}}(x)\end{aligned}$$

where I have used that  $\psi_{n\mathbf{k}}^*(x) \psi_{n'\mathbf{k}}(x)$  is periodic under  $x \rightarrow x + a$ . Then

$$\begin{aligned}\langle n\mathbf{k}|\mathbf{r}|n'\mathbf{k}\rangle_v &= \left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_{j=0}^{N-1}\right) \left(\int_0^a dx x \psi_{n\mathbf{k}}^*(x) \psi_{n'\mathbf{k}}(x)\right) \\ &\quad + \left(\frac{a}{N} \sum_{j=0}^{N-1} j\right) \left(\int_0^a dx \psi_{n\mathbf{k}}^*(x) \psi_{n'\mathbf{k}}(x)\right)\end{aligned}$$

The second integral vanishes by orthogonality of the wave functions and the first factor in the first term is unity, so

$$\langle n\mathbf{k}|\mathbf{r}|n'\mathbf{k}\rangle_v = \int_0^a dx x \psi_{n\mathbf{k}}^*(x) \psi_{n'\mathbf{k}}(x)$$

I believe another argument along these lines allows to show that  $C_{n\mathbf{k},n'\mathbf{k}}$  can be similarly written in terms of the boundaries of the primitive cell.

This kind of development is what I had in mind when I wrote “I suspect Eqs. (11-12) can be recast in terms of integrals over a the interior and the boundary of a single primitive cell, with wave functions normalized to the unit cell.” I leave it as an option for the authors to discuss this somehow in their revised manuscript.